

Which movement is 'best'?

At a duplicate bridge club near you the players are all about the same standard and take a keen interest in each week's results.

One evening there were 7½ tables when a pair of visitors turned up. As one had mobility problems, they were seated N/S at table 1. The director chose a Skip Mitchell ("E/Ws add 8"), extended so that they played 8 rounds. When the results appeared, the club N/Ss were horrified to find that the visitors (pair 1) had got a top on every board (all the other scores were flat).

Extended Skip Mitchell, no A/S

| Pair | | 8T | 8R | ESM | ASO | Match Points | |
|---------------|----|-------------------|----|--------|-----|--------------|--------------|
| North / South | | MPs/Max | | Score% | | | |
| 1 | 1 | Mr & Mrs One | | | | 112/ | 112 = 100.00 |
| 2= | 2 | Mr & Mrs Two | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 3 | Mr & Mrs Three | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 4 | Mr & Mrs Four | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 5 | Mr & Mrs Five | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 6 | Mr & Mrs Six | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 7 | Mr & Mrs Seven | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 8 | Mr & Mrs Eight | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| East / West | | | | | | | |
| 1 | 13 | Mr & Mrs Thirteen | | | | 64/ | 112 = 57.14 |
| 2= | 10 | Mr & Mrs Ten | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 2= | 11 | Mr & Mrs Eleven | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 2= | 12 | Mr & Mrs Twelve | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 2= | 14 | Mr & Mrs Fourteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 2= | 15 | Mr & Mrs Fifteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 2= | 16 | Mr & Mrs Sixteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 8 | 9 | Mr & Mrs Nine | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |

While the club N/Ss did not complain of unfairness, the E/W pair (9) who had played the visitors twice were vociferous in their expressions of discontent; on the other hand, the E/W pair (13) who had skipped the visitors were quietly delighted.

The next week there were again 7½ tables when the same visitors arrived and sat N/S at table 1. This time, because no-one wanted to be E/W at table 1 in an Extended Skip Mitchell, the director used a Share-&-Relay Mitchell. Again the visitors got tops on all the boards they played while all the rest were flat.

Share-&-Relay Mitchell, no A/S

| Pair | | 8T | 8R | SRM | ASO | Match Points | |
|---------------|----|-------------------|----|--------|-----|--------------|--------------|
| North / South | | MPs/Max | | Score% | | | |
| 1 | 1 | Mr & Mrs One | | | | 112/ | 112 = 100.00 |
| 2= | 2 | Mr & Mrs Two | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 3 | Mr & Mrs Three | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 4 | Mr & Mrs Four | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 5 | Mr & Mrs Five | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 6 | Mr & Mrs Six | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 7 | Mr & Mrs Seven | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| 2= | 8 | Mr & Mrs Eight | | | | 48/ | 112 = 42.86 |
| East / West | | | | | | | |
| 1= | 9 | Mr & Mrs Nine | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 10 | Mr & Mrs Ten | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 11 | Mr & Mrs Eleven | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 12 | Mr & Mrs Twelve | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 13 | Mr & Mrs Thirteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 14 | Mr & Mrs Fourteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 15 | Mr & Mrs Fifteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |
| 1= | 16 | Mr & Mrs Sixteen | | | | 56/ | 112 = 50.00 |

While all club N/Ss were again mortified, this time every E/W had played the visitors just once and they had were no complaints on that score. Some E/Ws were not bothered at all, since the results gave absolutely no indication whether they were better or worse than the visitors – or indeed the other N/Ss.

Some players however said they would have preferred an overall ranking. Hence, when the same situation occurred the following week, the director chose to arrow switch the movement. Again the visitors got tops on all the boards they played while all the rest were flat.

Share-&Relay Mitchell, A/S 1 round

| Pair | 8T 8R SRM AS1 | |
|-------------------------|---------------|--------|
| | MPs/Max | Score% |
| 1 1 Mr & Mrs One | 112/ 112 = | 100.00 |
| 2= 9 Mr & Mrs Nine | 56/ 112 = | 50.00 |
| 2= 10 Mr & Mrs Ten | 56/ 112 = | 50.00 |
| 4= 2 Mr & Mrs Two | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 3 Mr & Mrs Three | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 4 Mr & Mrs Four | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 5 Mr & Mrs Five | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 6 Mr & Mrs Six | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 7 Mr & Mrs Seven | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 11 Mr & Mrs Eleven | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 12 Mr & Mrs Twelve | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 13 Mr & Mrs Thirteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 14 Mr & Mrs Fourteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 15 Mr & Mrs Fifteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 4= 16 Mr & Mrs Sixteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 16 8 Mr & Mrs Eight | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |

The club players looked at the overall ranking and saw that one pair (8) seemed to have been treated particularly unfairly. Accordingly, some suggested that switching just one round was unfair; should half the rounds not be switched? Hence, when the same situation occurred the following week, the director arrow switched the last 4 rounds. Again the visitors got tops on all the boards they played while all the rest were flat.

Share-&Relay Mitchell, A/S 4 rounds

| Pair | 8T 8R SRM AS4 | |
|--------------------------|---------------|--------|
| | MPs/Max | Score% |
| 1 1 Mr & Mrs One | 112/ 112 = | 100.00 |
| 2= 4 Mr & Mrs Four | 60/ 112 = | 53.57 |
| 2= 5 Mr & Mrs Five | 60/ 112 = | 53.57 |
| 4= 3 Mr & Mrs Three | 56/ 112 = | 50.00 |
| 4= 6 Mr & Mrs Six | 56/ 112 = | 50.00 |
| 6= 2 Mr & Mrs Two | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 6= 7 Mr & Mrs Seven | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 6= 10 Mr & Mrs Ten | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 6= 12 Mr & Mrs Twelve | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 6= 14 Mr & Mrs Fourteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 6= 16 Mr & Mrs Sixteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 12= 8 Mr & Mrs Eight | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |
| 12= 9 Mr & Mrs Nine | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |
| 12= 11 Mr & Mrs Eleven | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |
| 12= 13 Mr & Mrs Thirteen | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |
| 12= 15 Mr & Mrs Fifteen | 48/ 112 = | 42.86 |

Since all the club pairs had performed equally, these results looked very unsatisfactory. Hence, when the same situation occurred in the next two weeks, the director tried two more movements. Each week the visitors got tops on all the boards they played while all the rest were flat.

Double Weave Mitchell, A/S 1 round

| Pair | 8T 8R DWM AS1 | |
|-------------------------|---------------|--------|
| | MPs/Max | Score% |
| 1 1 Mr & Mrs One | 112/ 112 = | 100.00 |
| 2 16 Mr & Mrs Sixteen | 56/ 112 = | 50.00 |
| 3= 2 Mr & Mrs Two | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 3 Mr & Mrs Three | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 4 Mr & Mrs Four | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 5 Mr & Mrs Five | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 6 Mr & Mrs Six | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 7 Mr & Mrs Seven | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 8 Mr & Mrs Eight | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 9 Mr & Mrs Nine | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 10 Mr & Mrs Ten | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 11 Mr & Mrs Eleven | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 12 Mr & Mrs Twelve | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 13 Mr & Mrs Thirteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 14 Mr & Mrs Fourteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |
| 3= 15 Mr & Mrs Fifteen | 52/ 112 = | 46.43 |

Hesitation Mitchell (with specified A/Ss)

| Pair | 8T 9R HM | |
|-------------------------|------------|--------|
| | MPs/Max | Score% |
| 1 1 Mr & Mrs One | 126/ 126 = | 100.00 |
| 2 9 Mr & Mrs Nine | 64/ 126 = | 50.79 |
| 3 10 Mr & Mrs Ten | 62/ 126 = | 49.21 |
| 4 8 Mr & Mrs Eight | 60/ 126 = | 47.62 |
| 5= 2 Mr & Mrs Two | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 3 Mr & Mrs Three | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 4 Mr & Mrs Four | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 5 Mr & Mrs Five | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 6 Mr & Mrs Six | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 7 Mr & Mrs Seven | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 11 Mr & Mrs Eleven | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 12 Mr & Mrs Twelve | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 13 Mr & Mrs Thirteen | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 14 Mr & Mrs Fourteen | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 15 Mr & Mrs Fifteen | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |
| 5= 16 Mr & Mrs Sixteen | 58/ 126 = | 46.03 |

At the end of all this, the players got together with the director and reviewed the different results, to see if they could decide which set gave the fairest picture of the players' relative abilities. What do you think?